

Barnes, Peter@Waterboards

From: patrick199@comcast.net
Sent: Sunday, February 08, 2015 10:49 PM
To: Barnes, Peter@Waterboards
Subject: Re: Lake Almanor
Attachments: gut-contents1.jpg; butt-lake-rainbow.jpg

That's good to hear. I'm glad we still have a chance to save the two lakes.

Have you ever been to Lake Almanor?

Have you been to Butt Lake?

My family had a house on the east shore of Lake Almanor when I was a kid. I think my dad bought the house in '76. I was about 9 years old at the time. Spent a lot of summer days running around the lake in a 10' jon boat with a 4 horse outboard. Good times.

After the house was sold I didn't go back until 2011. Now, I keep my RV in Canyon Dam from around March or April until the pipes start to freeze in November. There are lots of people just like me who love the area and don't want it to change.

When Almanor gets too busy or too windy I head over to Butt Lake. Butt Lake is also a special place. The last time Butt Lake received any fish stocking was in 1998. Any trout that live in Butt Lake either came through the pipe from Almanor or is a result of natural reproduction. Butt Lake fish (trout) are tougher than Almanor fish. I release most of the fish I catch there but the ones that make it to my table are always very good eating. The lake has a great population of pond smelt but it also has a lot of crawdads and aquatic insects for trout to feed on. It's a lot bugger than Almanor.

Cut open a Butt Lake fish and you're likely to see something like this:



This fish had been eating well. Pond smelt, lots of nymphs, beetles, bees, yellow jackets, and a few other things.

This is the fish..... toughest 3 pound rainbow I've ever caught.



I think the curtain at Butt Lake will do more damage than at Almanor. The Butt Lake ecosystem survives all by itself but it seems more delicate than Almanor. The lake used to produce trophy trout of epic proportions but after the lake was almost completely drained back in '94 for dam repairs, it has not bounced back to what it was. The squawfish came back stronger than anything else and I think that is why we're not seeing double digit trout come out of there, yet. **If a curtain is installed in Butt Lake, forget it. We'll never see another trophy come out of Butt Lake. The balance is just too delicate.**

A couple years ago I found two schools of 2-pound king salmon down by the dam at Butt Lake. These fish must have been sucked into the tunnel when they were just planted. The following year I caught several 4-pound salmon, in spawning colors, right at the Butt Lake Powerhouse. I assume these were the same fish I found the previous year and they were trying to make it back to Almanor.

I appreciate you taking the time to return all of my emails. You must be getting hundreds of emails about this. I'm just one of thousands of people who love these two lakes.

Patrick McGovern

From: "Peter@Waterboards Barnes" <Peter.Barnes@waterboards.ca.gov>

To: patrick199@comcast.net

Sent: Friday, February 6, 2015 1:25:29 PM

Subject: RE: Lake Almanor

Mr. McGovern,

This is absolutely not a done deal. The meeting in Chester is being held at the request of the Plumas County Supervisors. It is not a formality or a PR move, but rather an opportunity for concerned citizens to submit oral comments on the Draft EIR. We will have a court reporter present and all of the comments will be placed on the record.

When issuing a water quality certification, the State Water Board takes into consideration *ALL* available information. This includes, but is not limited to: the Draft EIR, Federal Energy Regulatory Commission's Final Environmental Impact Statement, PG&E's application for certification, studies, reports, meeting notes, and all stakeholder comments.

I hope that this answers some of your questions. Please let me know if there is anything else that I can help you with.

Sincerely,

Peter Barnes

From: patrick199@comcast.net [mailto:patrick199@comcast.net]
Sent: Wednesday, February 04, 2015 4:09 PM
To: Barnes, Peter@Waterboards
Subject: Re: Lake Almanor

Mr. Barnes,

I suppose it would be foolish of you to answer my question regarding where you stand, personally, on the issue. I was hoping for an answer but did not expect one.

I have one more question that I don't expect an answer to but I have to ask.

I know there is a public hearing in Chester next Wednesday evening.

I get the impression that this is just a formality or possibly a PR move to try and make sure the community does not grow to hate the agencies responsible for ruining the lake.

I also noticed that the only two measures that are still being considered both involve thermal curtains being installed in both lakes.

So, I ask you, is this a done deal?

Thank you for your time.

Patrick McGovern

650 619-5565

From: "Peter@Waterboards Barnes" <Peter.Barnes@waterboards.ca.gov>
To: patrick199@comcast.net
Sent: Wednesday, February 4, 2015 1:43:34 PM
Subject: RE: Lake Almanor

Mr. McGovern

Thank you for your additional comments. I will make sure that they are also added to the record and taken into consideration. Please let me know if you have any additional questions or comments.

Sincerely,

Peter Barnes

From: patrick199@comcast.net [mailto:patrick199@comcast.net]
Sent: Tuesday, February 03, 2015 5:18 PM
To: Barnes, Peter@Waterboards
Subject: Re: Lake Almanor

Mr. Barnes,

I have been reading as much as I can about the proposed thermal curtain at Lake Almanor and Butt Lake. I wish I had time to study it in depth but I do not.

From what I have been able to gather, I get the impression that the thermal curtains are the only methods that are even being considered.

It also seems like the most complex, most expensive, most controversial, and most destructive means to achieve the goal.

As for the goal itself, the ends do not seem to justify the means. Dropping the temperature of the water 40 miles downstream to save a few fish is going to destroy the upstream environment and make it impossible to sustain healthy fish in the two reservoirs. I have not been able to find any historical data that shows these thermal curtains are even effective. The might exist but I can't find examples.

Why have the simpler, less expensive, less controversial, and less destructive (and possibly more effective) approaches being considered with more enthusiasm?

I'm not an engineer or a biologist but I can think of several ways to keep the water from heating up on its way downstream.

For example, the water that comes out of Lake Almanor and goes to the Butt Lake Powerhouse via a big pipe. Well, the big pipe is painted green. In the summer, if you put your hand on the pipe it is very hot. It seems obvious to me that the pipe would be much cooler if it was painted white. There are more pipes down the line and I'm pretty sure they are green too.

Combine this with some more trees along the banks of the river channel and I bet the water could be at least a couple degrees cooler by the time it got down to the section of river that y'all are so worried about.

The curtains are really going to screw things up for a lot of people who need a healthy Lake Almanor. Every other alternative in the documents I have read were quickly discarded when minor obstacles appeared. Very little effort has gone into overcoming these obstacles, which leads me to believe that the agencies responsible for this really want to go ahead with the thermal curtain experiment.

I'm not a religious man, but I ask my religious friends to pray that this thermal curtain experiment is tossed out. It's a bad idea. Nobody wants it except the government agencies.

If you don't mind me asking, where do you stand on this issue?

Patrick McGovern

650 619-5565

From: "Peter@Waterboards Barnes" <Peter.Barnes@waterboards.ca.gov>
To: patrick199@comcast.net
Sent: Friday, January 16, 2015 8:19:49 AM
Subject: RE: Lake Almanor

Mr. McGovern,

For a more detailed analysis regarding the Upper North Fork Feather River Hydroelectric Project (FERC Project No. 2105) and the ongoing water quality certification process, I would recommend taking a look at our project webpage at: http://www.swrcb.ca.gov/waterrights/water_issues/programs/water_quality_cert/unfr_ferc2105.shtml.

We recently released the Draft Environmental Impact Report (EIR), which is probably the reason for the fishing guides request. I think that the Draft EIR, along with its Notice of Availability, would give you the most up to date information and analysis. The Draft EIR can be found here: http://www.swrcb.ca.gov/waterrights/water_issues/programs/water_quality_cert/unffr_ferc2105_eir.shtml. The Notice of Availability, which contains our Staff Recommendation, can be found here: http://www.swrcb.ca.gov/waterrights/water_issues/programs/water_quality_cert/docs/upper_feather_ferc2105/eir2014nov/unf_noa.pdf. The Level 1&2 Report and Level 3 Report, which are also appendices to the Draft EIR, also contain information relating to the development of project alternatives.

The Draft EIR is a large document with a lot of information so please feel free to contact me with any questions or additional comments.

Sincerely,

Peter Barnes

From: patrick199@comcast.net [patrick199@comcast.net]

Sent: Thursday, January 15, 2015 7:49 PM

To: Barnes, Peter@Waterboards

Subject: Re: Lake Almanor

Mr Barnes,

I must admit, I wrote that email at the request of one of the local fishing guides at Lake Almanor and I do not have a clear understanding of the issue.

I am in the process of reading the Rock Creek - Cresta Relicensing Agreement from December 6, 2000. This seemed like a good place to start but a lot of it is legal mumbo jumbo that won't help me understand either side of the argument.

So far I have not been able to find much information on the internet. I googled "thermal curtain" and the only results I got were for window treatments.

If you know where I can find more information please point me in the right direction so I can learn more about the situation.

Thank you.

Patrick McGovern

From: "Peter@Waterboards Barnes" <Peter.Barnes@waterboards.ca.gov>
To: patrick199@comcast.net
Sent: Thursday, January 15, 2015 2:57:36 PM
Subject: RE: Lake Almanor

Mr. McGovern,

Thank you for your comments. I will make sure that they are added to the record and taken into consideration. Please let me know if you have any additional questions or comments.

Sincerely,

Peter Barnes

From: patrick199@comcast.net [<mailto:patrick199@comcast.net>]
Sent: Thursday, January 15, 2015 11:51 AM
To: Barnes, Peter@Waterboards
Subject: Lake Almanor

Dear Mr. Barnes,

Thermal curtains might be a good way to keep a house warm but installing one in Lake Almanor will destroy a thriving ecosystem and there is no guarantee that it will help anything downstream.

Please don't let this happen. Nobody wants it. There must be a better way.

Patrick McGovern

Atherton, California

650 619-5565

